Planning and Health in the Time of COVID-19

1.5 CM Credits | #9198501
DISCLAIMER
This disclaimer applies to any APA California Webinar and any documents, information or opinions obtained from or ancillary to the Webinars. You are advised to read this disclaimer carefully before accessing, participating in, reading or making any other use of a APA California Webinar. APA California makes no representations or warranties about the accuracy or suitability of information provided in the Webinars and related materials (such as handouts, presentation documents and recordings). The information contained in the Webinars and related materials are not intended to constitute advice of any kind or the rendering of consulting, or other professional services. Registering for a Webinar only constitutes an agreement to attend, not a contract for consultancy or advice. Registration does not establish any contractual relationship with APA California. You should consult with an attorney, consultant or other professional to determine what may be best for your individual needs. The opinions expressed in a Webinar are those of the speaker(s) only, and may not necessarily represent the views of APA California, National APA or any local section. To the extent permitted by law, APA California and its agents and experts exclude any and all liability for any loss, claim or damage, cost or expense, including any indirect or consequential damages or lost profit, whether arising in negligence or otherwise, suffered in connection with the access to, participation in, or use of the Webinar by you or any other person. By acceding to this service, you acknowledge that the information and materials contained in the Webinar may contain inaccuracies or errors. The content of the information provided in the Webinar is for your general information and use only. It is subject to change at any time and without notice. The Webinar may include links to other resources or websites. These links are provided for your convenience only and do not signify that APA California endorses, approves, or makes any representation or claim regarding the accuracy, copyright compliance, legality, or any other aspects of, the resource(s) or website(s). Further, you are advised not to send any confidential or sensitive information to APA California in the context of a Webinar.
Planners4Health

The Planners4Health-California Initiative provides a framework for collaboration, tools and networking opportunities for planners and public health advocates across the State to improve health outcomes through the application of equity and healthy communities’ principles.

National
https://www.planning.org/nationalcenters/health/planners4health/

California http://www.planners4health-ca.org/
Welcome

Julia Lave Johnston
APA California Chapter President
Cases per 100,000 people

Bay Area
- 2,350 cases
- 61 deaths

California
- 8,156 cases
- 170 deaths

United States
- 184,183 cases
- 3,721 deaths

https://projects.sfchronicle.com/2020/coronavirus-map/
Agenda

1. Opening Remarks
   Miguel A. Vazquez, AICP, POC at Planners4Health California

2. Welcome
   Julia Lave Johnston, President at APA California

3. Housekeeping
   Diana Benitez, Planner at Raimi + Associates

4. Epidemiology + COVID-19
   Beth Altshuler Muñoz, MPH, MCP, Independent Consultant

5. San Mateo County Response Case Study
   Joshua Abrams, AICP, Principal at Baird + Driskell Community Planning

6. Small Group Discussions

7. Report Back

8. Next Steps
Housekeeping: Preparing for Discussions

- If you did NOT let us know what **breakout group** you wanted to be in during registration please send us a message via chat with your choice:
  - a. Housing and Development
  - b. Economic Development
  - c. Health, Community, and Social Services (including homelessness)
  - d. Transportation and Public Spaces

- **Muted** during presentations

- Type questions into **chat**

- **CM | 1.5 #9198501**

- **Attendance Poll**
Public Health, COVID-19 and Planning

Beth Altshuler Munoz, MCP, MPH
BethAltMunoz@gmail.com
Public Health Defined

“The science and art of preventing disease, prolonging life, and promoting health through the organized efforts and informed choices of society, organizations, public and private communities, and individuals.”

—Charles-Edward Armory Winslow

“Fulfilling society’s interest in assuring conditions in which people can be healthy.”

—Institute of Medicine

“Public health aims to provide maximum benefit for the largest number of people.”

—World Health Organization

Ten Essential Public Health Services

1. Monitor Health
2. Diagnose and Investigate
3. Inform, Educate, Empower
4. Mobilize Community Partnership
5. Develop Policies
6. Enforce Laws
7. Link to/Provide Care
8. Assure a Competent Workforce
9. Evaluate
10. Research
Epidemiology

- Epidemiology is the method used to find the causes of health outcomes and diseases in populations.
  - In epidemiology, the patient is the community and individuals are viewed collectively.
  - Epidemiology is the study (scientific, systematic, and data-driven) of the distribution (frequency, pattern) and determinants (causes, risk factors) of health-related states and events (not just diseases) in specified populations (neighborhood, school, city, state, country, global).
  - It is also the application of this study to the control of health problems.

Source: *Principles of Epidemiology, 3rd Edition*
NEED TO KNOW:

OUTBREAK vs. EPIDEMIC vs. PANDEMIC

OUTBREAK

The occurrence of a disease in a specific community in excess of what is expected in a defined area over a given period of time. A single case is enough to constitute an outbreak!

EPIDEMIC

The (often rapid) spread of a disease across a larger group in excess of what is normally expected (i.e., a large outbreak).

PANDEMIC

An epidemic that has spread to several countries or continents.
Where should we find information?

- Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC)
  - State Health Departments
    - Local Health Departments (counties and some cities)
    - Hospital Systems
  - World Health Organization
    - American Public Health Association (APHA)
What is COVID-19? Why is it dangerous?

- Severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2, or SARS-CoV-2 for short.
  - SARS-CoV-2 can trigger a potentially deadly respiratory disease called Covid-19
- 1-14 day incubation period
  - Contagious even with no symptoms
  - Might be contagious for up to 8 days after symptoms are gone
  - Long recovery time (increased burden on hospitals)
- Main mode of transmission
  - Respiratory secretions
  - Respiratory droplets in the air that land on surfaces
- Exponential growth curve - each person infects 2-3 others
Stay HOME!

“It’s for your own good. You’ve got to stop touching your face.”
Stay HOME!

Coronavirus: Upward Trajectory or Flattened Curve?
Cumulative confirmed COVID-19 cases in selected countries from day 1 to 40 after 100+ cases

- China
- Italy
- U.S.
- Spain
- Germany
- France
- South Korea
- UK

As of March 30, 2020
Source: Johns Hopkins University
Bend it like the Bay Area: Doctors see flatter curve after 2 weeks of social isolation

By DEBRA KAHN and CARLA MARINUCCI | 03/30/2020 10:03 PM EDT | Updated 03/30/2020 11:46 PM EDT

SAN FRANCISCO — State leaders and doctors are cautiously optimistic that the Bay Area's early moves to lock down residents two weeks ago have prevented
Social Determinants of Health (SDOH)

A PUBLIC HEALTH FRAMEWORK FOR REDUCING HEALTH INEQUITIES
BAY AREA REGIONAL HEALTH INEQUITIES INITIATIVE

UPSTREAM

SOCIAL INEQUITIES
- Class
- Race/Ethnicity
- Immigration Status
- Gender
- Sexual Orientation

INSTITUTIONAL INEQUITIES
- Corporations & Businesses
- Government Agencies
- Schools
- Laws & Regulations
- Not-for-Profit Organizations

LIVING CONDITIONS
- Physical Environment
  - Land Use
  - Transportation
  - Housing
  - Residential Segregation
  - Exposure to Toxins
- Economic & Work Environment
  - Employment
  - Income
  - Retail Businesses
  - Occupational Hazards
- Social Environment
  - Experience of Class
  - Racism
  - Gender
  - Immigration
  - Culture - Ads - Media Violence

RISK BEHAVIORS
- Smoking
- Poor Nutrition
- Low Physical Activity
- Violence
- Alcohol & Other Drugs
- Sexual Behavior

DISEASE & INJURY
- Communicable Disease
- Chronic Disease
- Injury (Intentional & Unintentional)

MORTALITY
- Infant Mortality
- Life Expectancy

PRIORITY: COMMUNITY CAPACITY BUILDING
- Community Organizing
- Civic Engagement

POLICY

Emerging Public Health Practice

Current Public Health Practice

Social Inequities

Health Disparities
What are Social Determinants of Health?

- Income / wealth
- Education
- Race / ethnicity
- Sex / Gender identity
- Built environment
- Stress
- Social support
- Early child experiences
- Employment
- Housing
- Transportation
- Food environment
- Social standing
- Immigration status

Public Health Emergencies Widen Social and Racial Inequities

- Xenophobia and hate crimes towards **Asian Americans**
- Many **communities of color** have higher rates of chronic diseases
- **Vulnerable populations** have a higher risk of exposure (incarcerated persons, homeless, immigrants, people with chronic conditions)
- **Low wage workers** are either
  - out of work and can't afford to stock up or pay rent OR
  - are now considered “essential” but are still not paid a living wage, don’t have access to protective gear at work, and aren’t able to homeschool their children
- Democracy vehicles are threatened (primary elections, US Census)
- **Students** (preschool through college) will have different levels of e-learning success depending on their home environment
- **Lower-income folks** are more likely to rely on public resources that are now limited or closed (public transportation, parks, libraries, etc.)

What does this mean for Planning?

- Do we need to reimagine public spaces? Public transportation?
- Will community engagement ever be the same?
- Will there be a national backlash against density? *(first outbreaks occurred in suburbs)*
- What tools do planners have to help the economy recover?
- How can we ensure people stay housed?
- How do we want to be remembered in historic accounts about the COVID-19 pandemic?

Like climate change, this is a challenging situation. **BUT** if we intervene it can be managed. Without extreme intervention, things could get very ugly.
Tips for Self-Care During COVID-19

- Exercise
- Eat Healthy
- Sleep
- Learn and Explore
- Talk with a Friend
- Structure and Routine
- Practice Mindfulness
- Spend some time in the sun
"You cannot heal the world until you heal yourself"
San Mateo County Case Study

Joshua Abrams
abrams@bdplanning.com, www.21elements.com
21 Elements

A collaboration among all jurisdictions in San Mateo County to improve housing planning and support policy implementation, with the goals of saving jurisdictions time and money, to better meet our collective housing needs.
Understanding the Basics
## Example

### Building Department Status

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City / Town</th>
<th>Contact / Building Official</th>
<th>City / Town Building Status</th>
<th>As of Date</th>
<th>Permit Center / Counter</th>
<th>New Permit Subm.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Atherton</td>
<td>Dino Francesconi</td>
<td>Closed to the public, performing electronic review of plans in the system</td>
<td>March 16 - April 7</td>
<td>1) Public counter open, 2) by appointment only, 3) or closed</td>
<td>1) In Person hard copy, 2) digital or hard copy, 3) digital only, 4) No submits at this time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belmont</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brisbane</td>
<td>Chai Lor</td>
<td>Closed to the public</td>
<td>March 16 - April 7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burlingame</td>
<td>Rick Caro</td>
<td></td>
<td>March 16 - April 7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colma</td>
<td>Chai Lor</td>
<td>Counter is closed to the public. We are doing plan review at home and some video inspections.</td>
<td>March 16 - April 7</td>
<td>By appointment only</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daly City</td>
<td>Mario Sigala</td>
<td>Closed to the public; city manager's desk</td>
<td>March 16 - April 7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Calls, questions,
Helping Inspectors
1. In the last 14 days, have you traveled to the following places:
   ○ China
   ○ Iran
   ○ Italy
   ○ Japan
   ○ South Korea
   ○ New York
   ○ Seattle
2. In the last 14 days, have you been in close contact with anyone known to have the Coronavirus?
3. Are you experiencing any fever, cough or shortness of breath?
4. Has everyone in the household followed the Shelter in Place order developed by the Health Officer, which requires people to avoid non-essential businesses and maintain 6 feet of distance from others not in the same household?
Eviction Moratorium
Nonprofit/Small Business Help
Lessons

- Plant seeds in good times
- Collaboration is important
- Human connection is important
- Build trust
- Remember the most vulnerable
Small Group Discussions

- Housing and Development
- Economic Development
- Health, Community and Social Services (including homelessness)
- Transportation and Public Spaces
Process

Community Agreements
- One mic
- Mute if not speaking
- Raise your virtual hand to request the floor
- Make Space, take space
- Throw glitter, not shade
- Open hearts, open mind
- Respect everyone's experiences and history
- When speaking, please get to the point
- The moderator has the right to interject at any point

Introductions
Name, Role/Organization

Everyone can take notes in your group's Google Doc
Moderators

Josh Abrams
Baird + Driskell
Community Planning

Natalie Hernandez
Climate Resolve

Kelly Rodgers, MLA
Streetsmart

Miguel A. Vazquez, AICP
RUHS-Public Health

Beth Altshuler Munoz, MPH, MCP
Consultant

Julia Lave Johnston
APA California

Rodolfo Rodriguez
Housing Authority of the City of Austin

Heather Wooten, MCP
Onside Partners

Diana Benitez
Raimi+Associates

Cindy Ma, AICP, LEED AP
KTGY

Sagar Shah, PhD, AICP
American Planning Association

Rodolfo Rodríguez
Housing Authority of the City of Austin

Jane Clough, Ph.D.
San Diego Association of Governments

Kate Meis, MSCRD
Local Government Commission

Elizabeth H. Tyler, Ph.D.
FAICP
Consulting Planner
Discussion Questions

(Answer these from the perspective of your organization AND as a community member)

1. Immediately
   a. What are the immediate challenges you’re experiencing or seeing (at work or in your community) related to your group’s topic?
   b. What are some initial things you/others have tried to respond to these challenges?
   c. Are there ways to make these responses more equitable for vulnerable populations?

2. Short- and Mid-Term (while Shelter in Place is in effect)
   a. What will be your work priorities after you learn how to navigate the new normal?
   b. Are there ways to make these responses more equitable for vulnerable populations?

3. Future (beyond shelter in place)
   a. What are challenges you anticipate facing after the shelter in place orders are lifted?
   b. How if at all are you already planning for this?
   c. Are there ways to make these responses more equitable for vulnerable populations?

4. What ideas do you have to continue to engage community members in COVID and non-COVID public actions/decisions?

5. What HELP (information, resources, services, etc.) do you need to address these challenges?
Report Backs
Next Steps

- Take the Online 2020 Census today
- Summarized Notes of this Discussion
- CALL TO ACTION
  - Join our next discussion (based on your feedback)
  - Sign up to volunteer as:
    - Webinar organizer/curator/speaker
    - Planners4Health California Steering Committee Members
  - Form alliances with other “planning-related” professional organizations

my2020census.gov
Contact Info:

Beth Altshuler Muñoz
BethAltMunoz@gmail.com

Joshua Abrams
abrams@bdplanning.com

Miguel A. Vazquez
mvazquez@ruhealth.org

Diana Benitez
diana@raimiassociates.com

Thank you!